This artistic reflection, like philosophy, is a quasitranscendental undertaking because it bears upon the foundations of our perception, our understanding, and our relationship to the world and other people. Art is thought, not theory. It actually seeks to postpone 'theory', to reroute judgments, opinions, and conclusions, and even to delay or suspend them indefinitely (Borgdorff 2012, p. 71)

Réflexivité Reflexivity

Artistic practices are reflective practices, and [...] this is external circumstances to position and contextualise their work and, as it were, justify it to funding bodies "materialising practices" which implies an ongoing temporary art also lies enclosed in contemporary and makes its own rules. It is an art that continuously

alising practices constitute relationships between process of the emergent work as enquiry. (Barrett 2007b, p. 5)

not just because artists are now increasingly forced by aspect of artistic research and the dynamics of the circulation of artistic products, is Barbara Bolt's notion of and to the public. The <code>reflexive nature of con-</code> performative engagement and productivity both at moments of production and consumption (Bolt 2004) art itself. This art accepts no natural law; cannot base Rather than constituting a relationship between image itself on an aesthetic foundation; has lost its normality; and text (implied by Carter's material thinking), materistarts anew at every level, from the organisation of the and text-of which the first iteration is necessarily the material to the reality presented. (Borgdorff 2012, p. 70) researcher's own self-reflexive mapping

L'artiste | The artist

Similarly to how anthropologists and ethnologists participate in the contexts that they study, the artist engages in a systematic study of his or her own artistic processes However, the interrelation between an artist, the cultural tools (material and psychological ones) and the artistic output is in itself complex, and the interactio between artists is accordingly a complex matter of embodied processes and the resonance between the self, the other and material objects (Coessens 2011; Nancy **2007; Östersjö 2008, 2013).** (Frisk 2013, p. 44)

clearly defined research questions, topics, or hypotheses

whose relevance to the research context or to art practice

has been established beforehand. Much such research

(Rubidge 2005: 8), in which the artist undertakes a

bly stumbling across unexpected outcomes or surprising

insights or farsights. Moreover, because the re-

degree of objectivity. (Borgdorff 2012, p. 80)

search on the basis of intuition and trial-and-error, possi

archers are intimately intertwined with

what they are exploring—much artistic research

actually serves their own artistic development—they do

not have ample distance to the research topic, a distance

that is supposedly an essential condition for achieving a

Eisner tells us that art objects have the capacity to go

Engendering empathetic participation and giving access

Increasing the number of questions that can be asked

Presenting a sense of particularity that the abstraction

Articulating the ways in which the transformation of

Eisner's understanding of artistic products

sufficient. It mirrors a tendency in creative arts research

digm, or take us far enough towards understanding what

is specifically generative about the creative arts research

as 'data' and as 'representations' is not

writing that fails to break free of the traditional para-

process itself and the nature of the artefacts that it

the personal (what is inside of consciousness) and the

of number and generalised laws cannot contain;

beyond propositional limits by:

Creating productive ambiguity;

to the emotional lives of others;

about the phenomena being presented;

private to the public sphere can occur.

produces. (Barrett 2014, p. 56)

Giving rise to multiple perspectives;

Neither expanding the concept of science to include art (or vice versa), nor the equalizing of art and science on the basis of interpretation being central for both seems to solve the problem of the fundamental difference between the products of art and of science. My suggestion is to accept this difference, and build artistic research not on an a priori ontological merging of the two forms of meaning and knowledge, but on an Critical assessment and self-assessment are integral herence to similar principles of research [...] artistic research as a rule does not start off with

Artistic research also qualifies as such **DOUNGARY**

is an activity undertaken in the borderland between the

art world and the academic world. The topics, the gues-

parts of artistic production today, not least within the **Practice**. (Anderson 2009, p. 7) community that works within the relational aesthetics tradition. Seminars, studio talks, etc. have become almost obligatory integral parts of art fairs, exhibitions parency and serious theoretical as well already existing interaction would not be a problem since artists, curators and others are already driving the process themselves. Adjusting this intellectual activity so differ from more traditional academic research, whose

today. (Anderson 2009, p. 7)

ties of artistic practice "We should avoid defin-

artistic research, to knock it into shape of the academic

disciplines". (Maharaj 2011, p. 39 cité par Frisk 2013,

tions, as well as the results of such research are judged, and have meaning, both in the art world and in academia. And in this respect artistic research appears to as to become more in line with other research assessing relevance and validity is determined primarily within activities would also benefit researching artists' interaction the community of peers, within the walls of academia, tion with the traditional academic community as it looks within the world of the universities.

(Borgdorff 2012, p. 132) Rapport avec l'académie | Relation with the academy

singularity of how art practice-theory-history and other and self-reflexive. Put differently, **We must have** 'disciplines' intersect and coalesce in individual projects. the courage to be anarchistic and experi-As we cannot quite know beforehand what form this will **mental**. (Hannula 2011 p. 70 cité par Frisk 2013, take [...] we have to be wary about attempts to regulate p. 41

[...] positioned at the interface of art an academia. (Borgdorff 2012, p. 3)

ing artistic research simply along institutions, we have to keep its possibilities open and move tional academic lines. This means focus on the towards a vision of artistic research which is self-critical

[...] if we want to hang on to the unorganized possibili- Since artistic research has been accepted and established Like the social sciences and humanities before it, the development of artistic research has proceeded in the shadow of the research 'model' par excellence, that is, Through its systematic procedures, methodological consistency and ongoing peer review, science lays claim to that correspond to facts in the world. discipline. In the academic world at least, artistic

WOLK—and in two different directions. Artistic research is not 'hypothesis-led', but 'discovery- led' research

thinking and writing about arts practice, it also needs to understand that the artistic research process is quite the reverse of the traditional research para**digm**—analyze to create becomes create then analyze.

'objective truth'. [...] Through its propositional form and statements or modelling of the world and the world, science establishes true or false statements. Similarly, the social sciences and humanities produce descriptions The creative arts, in contrast, are often criticised for the subjective and emergent quality of their research. Artistic often seems nebulous, unquantifiable and untestable its procedures and methods emerge in and through the work rather than being prescribed in advance by the research continues to be seen as lacking credibility because the methods cannot be replicated exactly, a principle central to scientific research. The lack of correspondence in findings between studies the lack of replicability or innovation in

its ability to establishing a correspondence between artistic research is still not a goal that is valued by the sciences. (Bolt 2016, p. 137)

at work in research. (Barrett 2014, p. 53) Interaction and intra-action in the aesthetic paradigm not only pertain to flows of communication and knowlactor is both subject and object of the research process and, in this paradigm, the movement of illumination always flows first through interaction (and intra-action) with matter and the materials of, then subsequently from the particular to the

> Julia Kristeva's account of dialectics as catastrophe in order to explain how creative practice engenders material processes that rupture meaning and language to allow the as yet unimagined and unrepresented to be revealed. (Barrett 2014, p. 54)

object or outcome of the research process.

(Barrett 2014, p. 54)

models from qualitative research, they stress the convincingness of its rhetoric and point out as the main requirement that the research be intersubjective so that ——expertise may not be readily available, but rather will future readers can assess its validity. They name five Higher levels of acceptable serendi points that are of prime importance for artistic research: in artistic research implies less reliar (1) presenting the research context and delineating

(2) credibility and explanations Communication should not be reified to mean publica-(3) the internal coherence and persuasiveness of th tion and conference attendance, but should also recog-

nize the need to form institutional platforms for inquiry (4) the usability, transferability and novelty value - It is important to assess correctly the level of maturity of a field since this dictates what kind of outputs can

As a criterion for the validity of research, following

research results to the artistic and How these five points are understood in practice depends on the artistic domain in question and to what extent ordinary artistic practice in that domain i tended stakeholder set of relevance for validation and use of knowledge generated. (Hellström 2010, p. 315) research-based. (Arlander 2013, p. 156)

[...] the value of artistic products and processes is locat-Esa Kirkkopelto [...] proposed [...] that: (1) an artist changes her artistic medium into a medium of research and (2) as a process of artistic research carries out and displays a certain change, it articulates itself as a

medium of invention. He stressed the shared and institu-"The inventiveness of an invention is in itself a matter evaluating the completed work within the context of the identified as: complexity, formality, precision, objectivity, of evaluation (is it something really new and different in research question or problem, rather than as an exhibirelation to previous devices and modes of practice; does — tion artefact. This approach has been useful for articulat- 2010). Admittedly, not all notions on this list lends even ingenuity, does not suffice to make an invention the capacity to produce new knowledge and to St research in any institutional or academic sense, to distin- understandings of the way in which knowledge emerges and functions quish it from art—and experimental art [...] Artistic research done by an artist outside institutions is worthy (Barrett 2014, p. 51)

of its name only if it has institutional cons [...] several 'tensions' related to the evaluation of artistic research were identified, namely those between order to resist them [...] As a consequence, the science and art, private and public value dimensions, criteria for evaluation would consist of considering to and qualities of an intrinsic and extrinsic nature. what extent an artist-researcher is able to present their (Hellström 2010, p. 314) invention as an institution. If they manage to do that,

planned outcomes

tional aspect of artistic research:

knowledge." (Arlander 2013, p. 157)

where such did not previously exist.

Due to the cross-sectoral character of artistic research,

extra attention must be given to identifying the ex-

At least two dimensions of public value seem applicable in the case of artistic research: those values arising from the work itself, which are 'contained' within the work, and which may be appreciated by a tutional setting associated with art and value, located somewhere in between these two, is embodied in the public function of intellectual commentary mative appropriation [...]. **Hedging**, on the other

ed—whether value is conceived as a quality inhering primarily in the artifact/text/play, etc., or in certain outcomes or epiphenomenal effects brought about by the activity. (Hellström 2010, p. 310)

[...] there is a need for an extended stakeholder set in

artistic research evaluation. With regard to peer review,

have to be approximated or created. Experts from related

to negotiate and calibrate their understanding of quality,

group and the evaluated party. [...] Traditional intrinsic

framework and data, aesthetic qualities of theories, ex-

planatory reach; that is, epistemic indicators. But artistic

research, due to its cross-sector quality, and its often

intrinsic values are closely connected to

the transformative effect of new knowl-

edge on an extended stakeholder set. In

this sense the stakeholder set and the intrinsic quality

indicators are closely tied together.

(Hellström 2010, p. 315)

rather practical research goals, suggests that such

indicators would amount to, for example, fit between

between each other, as well as between themselves as a

fields, including practitioners and other users, will have

explicitness, accuracy, hedging and responsibility (Gillett themselves to an easy transposition into the field of artistic research, although once one operates in material, visual or acoustic cultures most of these term will make sense outside of a limited propositional, textual use. [...] into the field of artistic research, although once one operates in material, visual or acoustic cultures [...] **complexity** means that a work also speaks of its reflective implications and its position within a context of practice, 'easy' solutions often impossible [... **explicitness** need, however, not be literal, for a work's proposition may very often lie in what it does not explicitly say. **ACCUI** or the context of artistic research may refer to the use of tools, devices or materi als, not, however as a demonstration of skill, but rather as the creation of an accurate relationship between any of these elements and the work's meaning. [...] public; and those values arising from an insti
Precision may be required, because even if a work does not look precise, this very character of notlooking-precise may be a precise way of entering th material, adding, for instance, justification to a transforby artistic research practitioners. (Hellström 2010, p. 310) hand, is not often openly discussed in the arts, but most people are very aware of the limits that a work accepts in order to remain comprehensible, [.. (Schwab 2012, p. 4)

The most important features of academic writing may be

Barad (2003, 2007) provides us with further scaffolding for grasping how material-discursive practices emerge from corporeal responses and are translated into lan

quage and thought. In experience-in-practice there is a Artistic research—as embedded in artistic and academic constant movement between the material world, the biological/material self (the self as 'other') and the contexts—is the articulation of the unreflective, non-con social self. This movement gives rise to a performative ceptual content enclosed in aesthetic experiences, enact production of knowledge or onto-epistemology. Crucial ed in creative practices, and embodied in artistic prodto this perspective is an acknowledgement of the agency ucts. The theme of unreflective action, non-conceptual content, and embodie of materials and matter. Matter is found to be as active as thought, language and form; and matter does not exist in separation from thought; because they are **QV**, which, starting with Husserl and continuing via Heidegger and Merleau-Ponty, has focused attention or co-existent, they intra-act as material-semiotic process

Barad's new materialist perspective on practice and her the nature of perception and the constitution of inte notion of 'agential realism', the attribution of agency not tionality and normativity, beyond an ontology in which the world was thought to be independent of our situatonly to tools and instruments of research but to brute matter itself (Barad 2003, 2007) permits us to articulate edness. (Borgdorff 2012, p. 168) more clearly what separates creative arts research from other paradigms. (Barrett 2014, p. 55)

articulation of the embedded, enacted solely the logic of rational thought, but involves di- 1994, Michael Gibbons and his colleagues [...] described mensions of a tacit and intuitive knowing how 'Mode 1 science' must now make increasing room that is derived from the senses and is made for 'Mode 2 knowledge production' possible through an alteration of language that occurs in Mode 1 refers to traditional, discipline-bound research the of the artwork. This places the aesthetic paradigm that takes place in academic contexts (mostly university)

outside of the positivist paradigm, which seeks to verify ties); it is characterised by organisational homogeneity, findings and generalisations, as well as the postpositivist uniformity, and stability. The quality of Mode 1 paradigm, which seeks to falsify generalisations. Both of research — which is primarily focused on the finding of these are founded on the assumptions that a fixed realitruths or the justification of beliefs—is assessed and ty exists to be observed and that only rational thought is controlled within each discipline by a peer review system, [...]. Mode 2 research, in contrast, is said to take place in the ics and other parties. Research is not conducted but also flows between thought, feeling and the materi- exclusively in homogeneous, uniformly structured uni-

al world. In artistic research, the artist as human versities, but is more localised in heterogeneous, diversi- practices and artworks disclose the world to us. The fied, often transitory configurations, [...] assemble around a particular set of problems. [...] artistic research is not primarily an academic (university) matter, but is carried out in what Gibbons et al., in their description of Mode 2, call the 'context of appli general through the audience's interaction with the art cation'. (Borgdorff 2012, p. 91)

and embodied content of artistic research? The significance of the current discussion at the intersec tion of phenomenology, cognitive sciences, and philosophy of mind lies in the prospects it may open for liberat ing the content of research in and through artistic pracpretive approaches that are so common in other research The constructivist perspective holds that objects and

events actually become constituted in and through art-

works and artistic actions. [...] Here lies the performative

presents them, thereby the world into what it is or could

and critical power of art. It does not represent things; it

be. The hermeneutic perspective assumes that artistic

world-revealing power of art lies in its ability to offer us

those new vistas, experiences, and insights that affect

Artistic research addresses this world-constituting and

world-revealing power of art—the ways in which we

(Borgdorff 2012, p. 171-2)

constitute and understand the world in and through art.

our relationship with the world and with ourselves.

If some form of **MIMESIS** does exist in art, it is here: in

insights that bear on our relationship to the world and to

the force, at once perspectivist and performative, by

which art offers us new experiences, outlooks, and

ourselves. This articulation of the world we live in is

what we may call the radical realism of artistic

been studied by thinkers who are concerned with understanding the relationship between physical events and mental phenomena, and who have replaced the notion of "materialism" with that of "physicalism" (Beckermann 1992: 1). Central to the work of such thinkers, is the theory of emergent evolution which asserts that as systems develop, their material configurations become more complex. A further claim of such theory is that, once a certain critical level of complexity is reached in any system, genuinely novel properties-those that have never been instantiated These emergent effects are not predictable before their first occurrence. (Beckermann 1992: 15-29). [...] the idea of emergent evolution provides a useful model gy in creative arts research. (Barrett 2007b, p. 6)

The broader concept of emergence has more recently

While the methods of science try to establish agreement visionality as a virtue. It does not necessarily attempt to determine a thing by description through theory and experiment but can **Propose ways of seeing**. (O'Riley 2011, p. 5)

Drawing on the phenomenology of Dan Zahavi, firstperson modality can be described as the first-personal sense of self-awareness. The self-consciousness ily entail some kind of reflection, introspection or higher-order monitoring As Merleau-Ponty has argued, it is an intrinsic feature of diate and non-cognitive reflexivity. (Zahavi 2005, 12, 16, research, and more particularly with ethnographic 21; Merleau-Ponty 1995/1962, 100.) The first-person perspective can be considered to include a weak and strong attribute. The strong attribute of first-person perspective denotes the reflective and more focal grasp participant and an observer. we can have on our self-experiences. The weak attribute (Borgdorff 2012, p. 123)

In creative arts research this requires situating the sub-

jective within a broader theoretical and historical con

text, and the application of critical theories that have

[...] the writing of the exegesis or research paper allows

the practitioner-researcher to synthesise and articulate

how the shift in language has occurred; and through

demonstrate how the work takes us beyond

what is already known. (Barrett 2014, p. 58)

diverge from the prescriptions set out in methodology

and searching— of which serendipity, chance inspira-

tions, and clues are an integral part—that takes artists

onto new, unbroken ground. They thus do not operate

within a well-circumscribed discipline that spells out

artistic search, which often transcends disciplines

as well. (Borgdorff 2012, p. 80-1)

what may and may not be part of the research strategy.

manuals. It is the very practice of unsystematic drifting

[...] academic writing [...] is the labour of **creating**

writing is propositional text, while for the debates

text, while the image has a mere communicative func-

tion; conversely, if a text explains an image, we think

that the image holds the meaning while the text merely

elaborates on that meaning. (Schwab 2012, p. 3)

subsequent contextual and comparative analysis,

the ability to at least partially translate the knowledge

their public and discursive form that can

It also implies that the most effective way of articulat

be understood and evaluated by a group of ing, documenting, communicating, and disseminating

research and society. The traditional model for academic but the way that uses the medium itself as its mode of

image or sound is of importance for a piece of writing. To research process and as the research outcome. DISCUI-

employ multimedia in the context of academic writing is **SIVE EXPRESSIONS MAY ACCOMPANY THE RE-**

not unheard of, but it is their relationship to the text that search, but they can never take the place

is of concern if it is thought of as representational. If an **of the artistic 'reasoning'**. At best, they can

image, for instance, appears to illustrate a text, we do 'imitate', suggest, or allude to what is being ventured

have the sense that what is to be said resides in the in the artistic research, or can be employed in a *post hoc*

[...] artistic research or creative arts enquiry reveals new

modes and methodologies that could be considered to

constitute a new paradigm of research distinct from the

dominant modes of qualitative and quantitative researc

that provide the default modes of research in the acade

my. This new paradigm of research could be deemed the

"performative paradigm", a mode of research characte

ised by a productive performativity where art is bot

being data that could be analysed using qualitative

Research in the arts likewise generally aims at interpret-

ing the particular and the unique, but in this type of

research practical experimentation is an essential ele

ITICE. In summary, research in the arts is per-

In artistic research, both the research topic and a broader-ranging impact than the development of their ed approach that draws on tacit and intu

the research questions and methods tend own artistry. Unlike other domains of knowledge, art itive processes that makes pattern difficult. Some-

to become clear only bit by bit during the research employs both experimental and hermeneutic times the transformations may seem to be so inchoate

products and processes. (Borgdorff 2012, p. 52)

productive in its own right as well as

and aesthetic modes. (Bolt 2016, p. 131)

around artistic research the use of other media such as language to still give primacy to the art itself in the

produced. [...] practitioner-researchers can use reflection
The insistence on the obligation to produce a written

ative potential of the artefact for knowl- dence, either in the capacity of the arts to speak in a

edge transfer and to acknowledge the crucial role meaningful, complex, and critical way in a medium of

of audiences as co-producers of knowledge that will con- their choosing, or in their own capacity to make sound

tinue to emerge beyond the immediate research context. judgements on the meaning, complexity and criticality

[...] artistic practices and creative processes are them-

selves the most suitable instruments of artistic research.

expression. One need not deny the inescapability of

reconstruction of the research process.

of artistic output as such. (Lesage 2013, p. 144)

[...] the goal is an expanded notion of academic writing

that includes a multiplicity of voices, di-

verse forms of presentation and an artistic

re-negotiation of what it means to add to knowledge

and understanding. (Schwab 2012, p. 5)

and analysis in the exegesis to **explore the gener-** supplement [...] appears to demonstrate a lack of confi-

relates to the immediate and non-objectifying sense of self involved in conscious experience. This experience belongs to what in phenomenology is most often referred to as the prereflective dimension of consciousness. Generally speaking, first-person givenness makes experiences subjective and entails a built-in selfreference (Zahavi 2005, 12, 16; Merleau-Ponty 1995/ **1962, 100, 371–372).** (Ravn Rouhiainen 2010, p. 96)

ities research, in particular to that in art studies and cul- to an autobiographical and narrative self, which introtural studies. These disciplines may provide interpretive frameworks that can also figure in research in and through artistic practice, such as hermeneutics, semiotics, critical theory, or cultural analysis. Sometimes artistic research has much in common with technological, applied research, particularly where the research is aimed at improving materials and techniques or at deexperience already on a pre-reflective level, as an imme- artistic research has a strong affinity with social science research or action research—whereby, in both cases, the subject and object of study are intertwined, and the researcher is both a

formed by artists as a rule, but their research envisages ential, involving a subjective and situat

methods in addressing itself to particular and singular that it is impossible to recognise them, let alone map

ticular knowledge, tacit and embodied nation in the research process. The epistemological and ontological premises of qualitative and artistic research are manifold, but the departure from

duces to selfhood, among others, the problems of the temporal dimension, memory, reflection and linguistic communities. The social constitution of this dimension of self is quite graspable. Our perspective (Zahavi 2005, 123, 151, 154, 155). As Zahavi life-stories evolve in interaction with others. They are interwoven in their stories and embedded in larger historical and communal meaning-giving structures. Our life-stories are then only partially determined by our own choices and decisions (Gallagher & Zahavi 2008, 201). This means that the concepts I use to express the salient features of the person I take myself to be are concepts derived from tradition and theory that will vary

social class and culture (Zahavi 2005, 108). (Ravn Rouhiainen 2010, p. 102) Qualitative research and artistic research are much closer [...] the Second-person perspective is con to each other than qualitative research and quantitative cerned with sharing experiences of other persons research. Both have rejected the possibility and desire through an inaccessible gap. We can experience, for exfor finding universal truths and have no interest in grand — ample, the anger of another through her or his verbal narratives. Both are interested in local and par- and physical expression. This experience usually comes as an immediate recognition that our being is witnessing **knowing and respect intuition and imagi-** the anger of another person. This means that selfawareness is not solipsistic. Integral to it is experiential interaction with the world. Self-awareness is always the selfawareness of a world-im-

widely from one historical period to the next and across

(2005, 123) states, in this sense "there is no pure nowhere". It is a view that we adopt arising out of at least two first-person perspectives; that is, it involves

Sometimes artistic research is closely related to human- Articulating the tirst-person perspective relates [...] the third-person viewpoint is concerned with a weperspective that considers a common, intersubjectively shared world. However, this social dimension is accessible only through the first-person perspective, which is mediated by the secondperson third-person perspective, just as there is no view from

[...] methodologies in artistic research are necessarily tion is derived from methods that cannot emergent and subject to repeated adjust—always be pre-determined, and "outcomes

fined here. (Borgdorff 2012, p. 23) (1) Artistic research concerns and affects the foundations In addition to the "approach of artistic research... the of our perception, our understanding, and our relationship to the world and other people. I would call this the gent nature of its methodologies and the intrinsically realism of artistic research. (2) Artistic research is 'material thinking': the articulation of non-propositional knowledge and experience, embodied in artworks and creative processes. This is the non-conceptualism of artistic research.

Not only experimentation in practice, but also reflec-

practice, may be part of research in the arts as de-

tion on practice and interpretation

Art practice qualifies as research if its purpose is to

expand our knowledge and understand

ing by conducting an original investig

tion in and through art objects and cre-

ative processes. Art research begins by addressing

questions that are pertinent in the research context and

in the art world. Researchers employ experimental and

knowledge that is situated and embodied in specific

artworks and artistic processes. Research processes and

outcomes are documented and disseminated in an ap-

propriate manner to the research community and the

wider public. (Borgdorff 2012, p. 53)

hermeneutic methods that reveal and articulate the tacit

(3) Artistic research is not about theory, but about thought. It is not primarily directed at 'knowing that ...' or 'knowing how ...'. It is directed more at a not knowing, or a notyet-knowing. It **creates room for that** This is the contingency of artistic research. (Borgdorff 2012, p. 124)

and, finally, the acknowledgement that instruments and sets our moral, psychological, and social life into motion objects of research are not passive, but emerge as co-producers in collaborative and, in the case of audiences, participatory approaches that may not be pre-determined at the outset of the research". (Barret 2014, p. 3 cité par Bolt 2016, p. 131-2)

which tries to find general laws. Nevanlinna suggests, in line with Sören Kjorup's argument, that "Perhaps only art knowledge is always also embodied in form and artistic research will realise the program of 'aesthetic matter. Creative processes, artistic practices, and artworks all incorporate knowledge which simul-Alexander Baumgarten in the 18th century: it produces taneously shapes and expands the horiknowledge of the singular. This kind of knowlzons of the existing world—not discursively, but in auditory, visual, and tactile ways, aesthetically laws, but it is nevertheless knowledge expressively, and emotively. (Borgdorff 2012, p. [...] artistic research reconfigures our understandings

In the history of epistemology, the distinction is mad between knowing that something is the case—theoretiis not a priori there to be discovered, but

to do something, to make something—practical edge, tacit knowledge. Artistic research operates mainly in the latter sphere. [...] artistic research could be described as first and foremost an articulation of the non-propositional forms of knowledge and experience in **Cal Or Sensory Interaction**—that is, from aesand through the creation of art. (Borgdorff 2012, p. 122) thetic experience. (Barrett 2014, p. 57)

Thus artistic research differs from empirical research,

research' proposed by the inventor of the term

edge concerns the singular and the

(Arlander 2013, p. 157)

The juxtaposing of disparate objects and ideas has, after all, often been viewed as an intrinsic aspect of creativit The interplay of ideas from disparate areas of knowledge in creative arts research creates conditions for the emergence of new analogies, metaphors and models for understanding

(Barrett 2007b, p. 7)

The problem for the artistic researcher is often recognis-

positivist paradigm is clear and cut. (Antilla 2010, p. 86) mersed self. (Ravn Rouhiainen 2010, p. 96)

their effects. (Bolt 2016, p. 141)

cess of enquiry. (Barrett 2007b, p. 6)

In his monograph, *Material Thinking*, Paul Carter (2004) helps to extend understandings of the subjective and relational dimensions of the artistic process. He describes ${\sf Heideager's}$ notion of "praxical knowledge" or what this process as one that involves a decontexualisation from established or universa discourse to instances of particular in

staging itself as an artwork, the particularity of experience is then returned to the universal. Carter suggests that "material thinking" specific to artistic of practice rather than vice versa. research creates a record of the studio process as a means of creating new relations of knowledge subsequent to production. (Barrett 2007b, p. 5)

The research process has the potential not only to open the field of artistic knowledge production to other disciplines and to other fields of interest, but also to open up the artistic practice under scrutiny to **New and unexpected areas** which will guide the development of the artistic work. (Frisk 2013, p. 45)

[...] within the context of studio-based research, innova

ment, rather than remaining fixed throughout the pro- of artistic research are necessarily unpredictable.

Caractéristiques | Caracteristics

that are appropriate to the study. The process and outcomes of the research are appropriately documented and disseminated to the research community tacit and intuitive processes, the experiential and emerand to the wider public. (Borgdorff 2012, p. 43) interdisciplinary dimension of this mode of research that In the medium itself—in the creative process, the artis derived from it material and social relationality" (Barret 2007, p. 7). Barrett also identified a number of work, and its effects—perspectives are reother attributes that qualify creative arts research as a new paradigm. These include processes that allow: "new **Shifted**, and new distinctions are articulated. The speobjects of thought to emerge through cycles of and cific nature of artistic research can be pinpointed in the way that it both cognitively and artistically articulates potential of the ambiguity and the indethis revealment and constitution of the terminacy of the aesthetic object and the world, an articulation which is normative, affective, which is unthought, that which is unex- necessity for ongoing decoding, analysis and translation and expressive all at once—and which also, as it were,

SVersal. (Barrett 2014, p. 53)

[...] just as the material basis of artistic research results

Nt, the subjective and personally situated aspect of

in approaches that are necessarily emer-

artistic research — its relationality or what Carter refers

2004:10) — results in research that is ultimately interdis-

to as its capacity to reinvent social relations (Carter

ciplinary. (Barrett 2007b, p. 7)

[...] the knowledge embodied in art, which has been variously analysed as tacit, practical knowl edge, as 'knowing-how', and as sensory knowledge, is cognitive, though non-con ceptual; and it is rational, though **non-discursive**. The distinctive nature of the knowledge edge content has been analysed in depth in phenomenology, hermeneutics, and cognitive psychology.

One of the strengths of artistic research is its capacity to uncover or reveal the aesthetic dimension of all forms of discovery. Pre-existing knowledge does not merely of how knowledge is produced, practitioner-researchers emerge from objects to be discovered by scientists, but need to go beyond this view of language and knowledge scientists work to emerge this knowledge through social production. I have previously drawn on Michael Polanyi interaction. Artists emerge it through material interac-(1958) and the work of Ian Sutherland and Sophia Krys tion and social interaction (Gibson 2010, p. 8). The Acord (2007) to discuss the way in which art gives rise material dimension articulates the subjective and the sensory as an inextricable occurs first through interaction in the and subsequently aspect of discovery. Knowledge through action **KNOWledge as action or 'knowing' that** involves the application of personal knowledge, sensaemerges from both thought and biologition and tacit and intuitive know-how in order to bring

tion and reflection are shown to underpin the about unexpected changes to the perceived world. emergence of new insights and knowledge. An often vexed issue in creative arts research is related to establishing the work in an identifiable location within the broader arena made up of more clearly de-

(Borgdorff 2012, p. 24)

Connaissance | Knowledge fined disciplines or domains of knowledge.

Subjective approaches in artistic research are implicated

Artistic research is the deliberate articulation of in and give rise to a second feature of practice as forces the contingent perspectives and world disclosures research: its emergent methodologies. Martin it imparts. In the debate on the epistemology of artistic he theorised as the material basis of knowl provides a research, an antithesis repeatedly surfaces: between explicit, manifest knowledge and implicit or tacit knowl philosophical framework for understanding the acquisition of human knowledge as emergent. His work also edge, and between knowing that something is the case provides a rationale for applying emergent approaches and knowing how to do or make something. I propose in research. Praxical knowledge implies that to add a third side to this: not knowing.

provided by research and the lateral spaces of the image

or artwork that resist being pinned down to an argu-

ideas and theory are ultimately the result (Borgdorff 2012, p. 71)

ment. (O'Riley 2011, p. 4)

ence. I would assert that the relationship between these and embodiment. (O'Riley 2011, p. 6)

[...] thinking, or doing could be regarded as cognitive

subject (the thinking individual engaged in the research)

of an underlying process. At root, they refer to a binding

acts. If textual and visual research shares a common

perhaps these activities can be seen as manifestations

activity. They may be different manifestations or ways

tacit. No convincing practice can exist

2005). (O'Riley 2011, p. 6)

without a degree of criticality of both

[...] art that understands itself as research, in that scientific processes or conclusions become the instrument of lar phenomenon in contemporary art, in particular in extension, so are the practices of research and art. The physical context that provides the ground for an image, for example, can become part of the work. The intellectual or emotional context provided by the viewer can equally be absorbed or conversely determine a work's impact. Movement between these realms mirrors th movement between, for example, an intellectual context

In artistic research, movement is therefore from the par-

riencing of the artwork itself. [...] **cycles of interac-**

transfer and testing against what is already known

ticular/private to the general/public domain. Knowledge

Wherein lies the specific nature of artistic research? Is

that in the research object—the uniqueness of artistic

practice, of the work of art, of the creative process?

Or does it lie in the research process—in the course it

follows, the working procedures, the methods? Or, from

a third point of view, does artistic research seek to reveal

onconceptual, non-discursive, sensory

Art practice qualifies as research when its purpose is to [...] art research focuses on art objects and creative pro-

broaden our knowledge and understanding through an cesses. This can involve aesthetic, hermeneutic

that are pertinent to the research context points of view. If the focus of investigation is on

and the art world, and employs methods the creative process, one should not lose sight of the

performative, expressive, and emotive

result of that process—the work of art itself. Both the

material content and the immaterial, non-conceptual

and nondiscursive contents of creative processes and

in the research study. In all cases, art research should

examine the embeddedness and situatedness of its

object of investigation.

(Borgdorff 2012, p. 46-7)

artistic products may be articulated and communicated

To see artistic research as 'embodied' knowl-

tive-computational circuits that tend to be seen as

processes (Varela 2000). (Maharaj 2004, p. 9)

[...] implications related to artistic cognition:

creators, critics and theorists.

• First, it is acknowledged that the thinking artist is a

strategies that dislodge discipline boundar-

ies, override media conventions, and dis

rupt political interests as they take on roles as

Second, seeing, experiencing and thinking in artistic

mental and physical. [...] As such, artistic cognition is a

form of human knowing that is embodied within artistic

practice and incorporates creative and critical processes

• Third, the image instinct that gives rise to a creative

impulse is a continuously changing, dynamic process

that makes use of the connective capacity of concepts,

forms, and contexts, and stimulates a mindful search

sense, artistic research is a 'post-discipline'

that takes place within and beyond the parameters of

existing knowledge systems and structures. In this

as mind and matter converge in the many contexts

within which art practice takes place.

practice. (Sullivan 2011, p. 118)

contexts activates cognitive processes that are both

practitioner-researcher who uses many visual cognitive

edge is to differentiate it from conceptual-specula-

selfenclosed and detached from motor-sensory-somatic

knowledge, as embodied in artistic prod

UCts and processes? (Borgdorff 2012, p. 79)

original investigation. It **begins with questions**

a special form of knowledge—tacit, practica

institutional-critique, whereby research is considered a part of the artistic process and is retical and practical.". Art and theory, in effect carried out by the artist herself. In this case, are nothing more than two different art is in fact a form of knowledge. It becomes the site of nowledge production and does not restrict itself to inteinterpreted as a constitutive element of the artistic prac- to the point nor does art sensualize philosophical truth tice itself, and scientific methods of research and knowledge generation enter into the artistic process.

art and are used in the artworks. This refers to a particu- mere reflection on practice. Deleuze perceives this unique relationship as "a system of relays within a larger sphere, within a multiplicity of parts that are both theo-In this constellation, philosophy neither brings the art philosophy serves a knowledge-based artistic practice as a point of reference, similar, conversely, to how art might

With regard to the relationship between philosophy and

art, this implies that artistic practice is more than just an

application of theory and that theory is more than a

affect theoretical practice. (Bush 2009, p. 1) The interpretive perspective holds that theory

To understand what artistic research is, it is vital to

exclusive) perspectives on the relation between [.

theory and practice, [...] I distinguish (a) the inst

furnishes the tools and material knowledge that are

applied to the artistic process or product

(Borgdorff 2012, p. 18)

explore the relationships between practice and theory

the arts. By outlining four ideal-typical (but not mutual

of expressing an underlying process but they share a A different view could posit a more enmeshed relationcommon source: for example, to make a thing involves ship between research and practice, where the former is an intrinsic part of the latter and vice versa. That is, constant thinking that is sometimes overt but frequently practice is imbued with the rigor, criticality, knowledge of context, and questioning associated with research? itself and the context in which it oper-And research is in a sense determined by the drive ates. Likewise, thinking is rooted in practical experiafforded by practical thinking, experience, enactment,

practices that are described by those theories.

activities, between research and practice or image and .] intertwinement of theoretical and text, is fundamentally intertwined: they are relational **practical agency.** (Borgdorff 2012, p. 2)

(Borgdorff 2012, p. 11)

(Borgdorff 2012, p. 17) The instrumental perspective suggests that 'theory' serves the creative process or performance practice in the arts. [...] Each art discipline thus has its own (Borgdorff 2012, p. 20) Theories exercise their performative power on the very 'theory' – instrumental knowledge specific to the craft, needed to practise the art form in question. [...] Yet beyond the technical know-how and professional knowledge often referred to as theory, the instrumental perspective also embraces theory or theoretical research of an exploratory or applied nature. [...] Theory, as it were,

mental perspective, (b) the interpretive perspective, (c) the performative perspective and (d) the immanent perspective. 'world-constituting' quality [...] an understanding of art which itself constitutes a fertile ground and starting point for new art practices and products [...] theory itself is a practice, and that theoretical approaches always partially shape the practices they focus on. The **immanent perspective** hence reminds us

that there is also no such thing as 'innocent' practice. [...] All practices embody concepts, theories, and understandings. [...] no practices and no materials exist in the arts which are not saturated with experiences, histories, or beliefs. There is no unsigned material, and that is one reason why art is always reflexive. There is no 'natural law' of art; its nature is second nature, preshaped by history, culture, and theory. (Borgdorff 2012, p. 21)

provides reflection, knowledge, and understanding

In this sense, 'theory' basically involves any form of

reflection on artworks, or on the production or the

reception of art, that rises above the level of the craft

itself. [...] An understanding of artistic processes and

products from a philosophical, ethical, historical, her-

meneutic, reconstructive, deconstructive, or generally

contextualising point of view is (or should be) part of

any artistic research. (Borgdorff 2012, p. 19)

with respect to artistic practices and products. [.

Cartographie des enjeux reliés au terme «Artistic Research». À partir d'un corpus de plus de 200 articles.

> Cartographie (en cours) de la recherche-création : Louis-Claude Paquin, Cynthia Noury. Design graphique : Jean-François Renaud. Version : mars 2018

Mapping of issues related to the term 'Artistic Research'

from a corpus of more than 200 articles.

Cartes et références disponibles à la paquin.com

À propos...